

Table 9-3
Comparison of Remedial Alternatives
Upland Areas
Investigation Area H1
Mare Island, Vallejo, California

Evaluation Criteria	Alternative 1 No Action	Alternative 2 Hot Spot Removal HQ=10	Alternative 3 Hot Spot Removal HQ=5	Alternative 4 Hot Spot Removal HQ=3	Alternative 5 Hot Spot Removal HQ=1
Overall Protection of Human Health and the Environment	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Compliance with ARARs	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Long-Term Effectiveness	5	4	3	2	1
Reduction of Toxicity, Mobility, Volume	5	5	5	5	5
Short-Term Effectiveness	5	2	2	2	2
Implementability	1	2	3	4	5
Cost	n/a	2,976,000	3,006,000	3,160,000	19,181,000
Total Score	16	13	13	13	13
Overall Rating	5*	4	3	1	2
Alternative Meets Threshold Criteria? Yes/No Balancing Criteria Ranking Scale (Alternative with lowest Total Score receives best Overall Rating) 1 Meets Criteria Best 5 Meets Criteria Least * No Action Alternative does not meet threshold criteria and therefore obtains least favorable Overall Rating					

Note:
ARAR = Applicable or Relevant and Appropriate Requirement
HQ = Ecological Hazard Quotient
n/a = Not applicable